

AOE 4144: Applied CFD

A series of 12 lectures by Prof. Raj (course co-instructor)

Reflections on the Effectiveness of Applied Computational Aerodynamics for Aircraft Design

Pradeep Raj, Ph.D.

Collegiate Professor Emeritus Kevin T. Crofton Department of Aerospace and Ocean Engineering Virginia Tech, Blacksburg, Virginia, USA http://www.aoe.vt.edu/people/emeritus/raj.html

Program Management Director, Lockheed Martin (Retired) Deputy Director, Technology Development & Integration The Skunk Works[®], Palmdale, California, USA LOCKHEED MARTIN

Lecture 8

Topic 5: Evolution of Applied Computational Aerodynamics (Part 4 of 5)

Copyright © 2019 by Pradeep Raj. All Rights Reserved.



List of Topics

Preface

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Genesis of Fluid Dynamics (Antiquity to 1750)
- 3. Fluid Dynamics as a Mathematical Science (1750–1900)
- 4. Emergence of Computational Fluid Dynamics (1900–1950)
- 5. Evolution of Applied Computational Aerodynamics (1950–2000)
 - 5.1 Infancy through Adolescence (1950–1980)

Level I: Linear Potential Methods (LPMs)

Level II: Nonlinear Potential Methods (NPMs)

5.2 Pursuit of Effectiveness (1980–2000)

Level III: Euler Methods

Level IV: Reynolds-Averaged Navier-Stokes (RANS) Methods

- 6. ACA Effectiveness: Status and Prospects (2000–20xx)
 - 6.1 Assessment of Effectiveness (2000–2025)
 - 6.2 Prospects for Fully Effective ACA (Beyond 2025)
- 7. Closing Remarks

Appendix A. An Approach for ACA Effectiveness Assessment



Free-vortex Flow Simulation Using Euler Codes

• Eriksson and Rizzi (1981); Hitzel & Schmidt (1984); Murman & Rizzi (1986)

- Euler equation solutions on delta wing at 0.9 and 1.5 Mach numbers and $\alpha = 15^{\circ}$; free vortices captured automatically—1981 IV GAMM Conference
- o 1984: Journal of Aircraft, 21 (10); 1986: AGARD Symposium, Aux-Ed-Provence, France
- Raj and Sikora (1984)—Recent Encounters with an Euler Code* (FLO-57GWB)
 Sharp-edged cropped delta wing (M = 0.6)



*inspired by Steven Spielberg's Close Encounters of the Third Kind—a 1977 American SciFi classic—he wrote and directed



TEAM (Euler) Validation Strake-Wing-Body Configuration – *Free-Vortex Flows*

• Raj, Sikora and Keen (1986) - *ICAS 86-1.5.2*



"...generation of vortices about sharp-edged wings due to the total pressure losses is quite insensitive to the actual magnitude of numerical dissipation,

as long as there is some."

Euler Codes More Effective Than The-then RANS Codes



TEAM (Euler) Validation

75°/62° Double-Delta Wing Body Configuration - Free-Vortex Flows



"Recognition" by Aircraft Designer—Doesn't Get Better Than That!



TEAM Capabilities Evolution Summary

	Configuration Geometry	Grids	Free- stream Mach number	Flow Model
1984	•Wing •Wing-Body	 Single Zone (Block) C-H, C-O, O-O topologies 	Subsonic Transonic Supersonic	Inviscid (Euler)
1986	 Wing Wing-Body Wing-Body-Tail/Canard 	 Single Zone (Block) C-H, C-O, O-O O-H, H-H topologies added 	Subsonic Transonic Supersonic	Inviscid (Euler)
1988	 Wing Wing-Body Wing-Body-Tail/Canard Full Aircraft with Inlet and Exhaust Systems 	 Single Zone (Block) Patched Multi-Zone (Multi-Block) C-H, C-O, O-O, O-H, and H-H topologies 	Subsonic Transonic Supersonic Hypersonic	 Inviscid (Euler) Viscous (RANS with only Baldwin-Lomax turbulence model) Equilibrium Real Gas

USAF/WRDC/Lockheed TEAM Code Offers Full Aircraft Aerodynamic Analysis Capability in 1988 for ATF Application (Inviscid Euler Much More Effective than Viscous RANS)



TEAM (Euler) Application YF-22 Dem/Val Configuration (1988)



USAF/WRDC & Lockheed Investment Pays Off!

COLLEGE OF ENGINEERING KEVIN T. CROFTON DEPARTMENT OF AEROBYACE AND DOCEAN ENGINEERING VIRGINAL ENGINEERING TEAM (Euler) Application: YF-22 Dem/Val

1988: Full-aircraft Analysis for Airloads Prediction (Reaser and Singer)

- Several transonic and supersonic Mach numbers
- Symmetric and asymmetric flight conditions
- Flow-through as well as powered nacelles



TEAM results generated <u>before</u> wind-tunnel pressure model test Code used in predictive mode*; no grid adjustments made for 'better/improved' correlations!

L8



Computing Advances: Key to Success

1975-1990: More than 2 orders of magnitude improvement in speed and memory



By 1990, Euler Solutions on Million-cell Grid in 6 to 8 Hours...But Weeks of Grid-Generation Time Hampers Effectiveness!



TEAM (Euler) Effectiveness (1988-1989) Assessment Based on YF-22 Dem/Val Application

- (-) Long Turnaround Time: Tedious and time consuming grid generation
 - Two engineers spent <u>few hundred man-hours</u> over <u>several weeks</u> to build a 43-zone H-H topology hexahedral grid with approximately 1.5 million nodes for half the configuration
- (-) Only Inviscid Drag: Program personnel want total drag—not getting it is one of their key complaints

Lift reasonably well predicted for transonic flight conditions







- (+) Detailed Surface Pressures Useful: for structural design as well as thermodynamics groups
 - Structural Design group wants force, moment, and surface pressure increments due to control surface deflections



Challenge: Too Many Grids, Too Little Time!

TEAM Run Times 'Reasonable', but Effectiveness Too Low to Meet the Needs of F-22 EMD that Lockheed Hoped to win in 1991



Efforts to Increase TEAM Effectiveness 1989 - 1991

- Total (Absolute) Drag: add viscous effects for increased realism ٠
 - Coupling with integral boundary-layer codes? Not well suited for fighter analyses 0
 - Extend TEAM by adding N-S viscous terms? In-house TRANSAM efforts initiated in 1986 0
- Grid Generation: make it faster and less labor-intensive ۲
 - Multi-block hexahedral grids \bigcirc
 - **Overlapping grids** Ο

EVIN T. CROFTON DEPARTMENT OF

- **Cartesian grids** Ο
- **Unstructured tetrahedral grids** 0
 - **AIRPLANE Code:** Lockheed procured unstructured tetrahedral grid Euler code in 1990 from Jameson's Intelligent Aerodynamics, Inc., Princeton, NJ

Key Challenge:

AIRPLANE Solution

How to develop requisite level of competency and confidence in brand new methods in order to lower the risk enough by early 1991 for F-22 EMD applications? In 1990, aerospace industry went into depression leading to (a) reduction in the number of qualified engineers, and (b) significant reductions in R&D funding!

- Interim Path Forward: make maximum use of multi-zone structured grid—once it's *built*—since structured grid generation methodology was then the most mature
 - Use surface transpiration concept to "simulate" the effect of control surface 0 deflection by appropriately changing the no-normal-flow surface boundary condition





Innovative Approach to Estimating Incremental Loads Due to Control Surfaces

- **Customer's Problem:** Estimate incremental aerodynamic forces, moments, and surface pressures due to control surface deflections for multiple settings and flight conditions to support structural design
- **Solution:** Use *surface transpiration concept* to "simulate" the effect of control surface deflection by appropriately changing the no-normal-flow surface boundary condition
 - NO NEED TO CHANGE THE INITIAL GRID!
 - The concept—originally proposed by Lighthill—had enjoyed great success in simulating the effect of boundary layer on inviscid flow modeled using potential or Euler methods



Solution developed and implemented in 1989-90; published in 1993, AIAA Paper 93-3506

Results Improved Confidence in Meeting Customer Needs



The Exciting Eighties!

• April 12, 1981: Launch of the First Space Shuttle Mission

- Mission Commander John Young had already flown in space four times, including a walk on the Moon in 1972
- **Bob Crippen**, the pilot, was a Navy test pilot who would go on to command three future shuttle missions
- June 1981: USAF ATF Request for Information (RFI)
- September 26, 1981: Boeing 767 First Flight
 - September 8, 1982: original 767-200 entered service with United Airlines
 - October 1986: 767-300 followed by 767-300ER in 1988
- February 19, 1982: Boeing 757 First Flight
 - o January 1, 1983: original 757-200 entered service with Eastern Airlines
 - Compared with 707 and 727, it consumed approx.
 40% less fuel per seat, on typical medium-haul flights

• December 14, 1984: Grumman X-29 First Flight

- Experimental aircraft that tested forward-swept wing, canard control surfaces, and other novel technologies
- September 1985: USAF ATF Request for Proposal (RFP)
- October 1986: Lockheed and Northrop Awarded 50-month Prototype Dem/Val Contracts
 - First Flights: YF-22 (29 Sep 1990); YF-23 (27 Aug 1990)

• February 22, 1987: Airbus 320 First Flight

18 April 1988: entered service with Air France

















The Exciting Eighties (for the Author!)

Personal

1980

- Granted US Permanent Resident status
- And...



198119851st son2nd son1985Naturalized US Citizen

Professional

• AIAA & SAE

- o AIAA ASM: St. Louis (1981), Reno (1983, 1984, 1987)
- o AIAA APA: Danvers (1983), Williamsburg (1988)
- AIAA Euler Solvers Workshop: Monterey (1987)
- SAE Aerospace Tech Conf. & Expo: Anaheim (1988)
- Two AIAA Technical Committees: *Fluid Dynamics (1985-88)* and *Applied Aerodynamics (1988-91)*

ICAS* Congress

- Toulouse (1984), London (1986), Stockholm (1990)
- 3rd Intl. Congress of Fluid Mech., Egypt (1990)
- After-hours teaching (1985-1990)
 - Lockheed Employee Edu. Pgm. (Aerodynamics for Designers)
 - UCLA Continuing Education (Introduction to Aerodynamics)
 - Lockheed Tech Institute (Computational Fluid Dynamics)
- Lockheed consolidation (1987)
 - Three companies into one: Lockheed Aeronautical Systems Company (LASC) headquartered in Burbank, California
 - Loss of CFD and ACA talent and expertise in Georgia

• Appointed Comp Aero Technical Lead (1989)

 Represented LASC on Corporate Task Force on Advanced Computing Methods (ACM) *International Counci

*International Council of the Aeronautical Sciences

Copyright © 2020-2022 by Pradeep Raj. All Rights Reserved.



The Exciting Eighties (for the Free World)

Final Collapse of the USSR & Emergence of the New World Order



A Pivotal Event in World History: November 9, 1989



Fall of Berlin Wall Created New Geo-political Realities



The Nasty Nineties Followed the Exciting Eighties!

- "Peace Dividend"—*Major Contributor to Depression in US Aerospace Industry*
 - Loss of 495,000 people (37% of workforce) in just five years (1990-1994)
 - Overall sales down 9% in 1994 after single-year 10% drop in 1993
 - Aerospace industry dramatically reduced R&D funding in response to DoD budget decline



Consolidations, Mergers, and Reorganizations—To Reduce Capacity & Cost





New Opportunities: 1990-91

• May 1990: Lockheed Reorganization—one company into two!

- Decides to vacate Burbank—split operations between Palmdale and Marietta
 - Lockheed Advanced Development Company (LADC), Palmdale, California
 - Lockheed Aeronautical Systems Company (LASC), Marietta, Georgia

• 23 April 1991: YF-22 is the winner!

- Secretary of the US Air Force Donald Rice announced Lockheed's YF-22 as the winner
- LASC to work the F-22 Engineering and Manufacturing Development (EMD) contract in Georgia
- Raj relocates to Georgia in August 1991
- 13 December 1991: LASC selects two Technical Fellows in the inaugural year
 - Chellman (Structures) & Raj (CFD)
 - Most Senior Rank in Technical Track
 - Increased Emphasis on Mentoring and Technical Leadership
 - Key Challenge: <u>Rebuild Capabilities in Georgia</u>







Lecture 8: Key Takeaways

- 1985-1988: TEAM validation using many configurations and a range of flow conditions
- 1988: TEAM (Euler) analysis of full YF-22 Dem/Val configuration
- 1988-1989: Assessment of TEAM (Euler) Effectiveness based on YF-22 Dem/Val application
 - Grid Generation: Tedious and time consuming
 - Extensive Validation: Limited value (Lesson Learned: validation must be done for geometries and flow conditions that aren't substantially different from the intended application)
 - Total Drag: Unable to predict using inviscid Euler code
 - Surface Pressures: Deemed useful for structural design...but increments for deflected control surfaces would be <u>really useful</u>
- Many promising technologies to increase Effectiveness, but none mature enough to meet the anticipated needs of F-22 EMD effort in 1991
 - Interim Path Forward: Make maximum use of the multi-zone grid for the baseline configuration once it is built
- 1990: Innovative Approach to estimation of incremental loads due to control surface deflections for <u>multiple settings</u>
 - Surface transpiration concept incorporated in TEAM to simulate control surface deflections



Lecture 8: Key Takeaways (contd.)

The Exciting Eighties

- Launch of the 1st Space Shuttle (April 12, 1981)
- USAF Advanced Tactical Fighter (ATF): RFI (Jun 1981); RFP (Sep 1985); 50-month Dem/Val contract award to Lockheed and Northrop (Oct 1986)
- o Boeing: **767** first flight (Sept 26, 1981); **757** first flight (Feb 26, 1982)
- o Grumman X-29 First Flight (Dec 14, 1984)
- Airbus 320 First Flight (Feb 22, 1987)

The Nasty Nineties

• "Peace Dividend" from the fall of the USSR contributed to US aerospace industry depression resulting in **mergers and consolidations**: **15** *down to 4 in 7 years*!

• 1990-91: New Opportunities

- Lockheed reorganization—one company into two
- Lockheed awarded F-22 EMD contract
- Raj selected Tech Fellow



BIBLIOGRAPHY Topic 5

5. Evolution of Applied Computational Aerodynamics (1950-2000)

5.2 Pursuit of Effectiveness (1980–2000)

- 5.2.1 Miranda, L. R., "Application of computational aerodynamics to airplane design", AIAA Journal of Aircraft, Vol. 21, No. 6 (1984), pp. 355-370. (Also AIAA Paper 82-0018, 20th Aerospace Sciences Meeting, Orlando, Florida, January 11-14, 1982) <u>https://doi.org/10.2514/3.44974</u>
- 5.2.2 Rizzi, A. and Eriksson, L.E., "Transfinite Mesh Generation and Damped Euler Equation Algorithm for Transonic Flow Around Wing-Body Configurations," AIAA Paper 81-0999, June 1981.
- 5.2.3 Jameson, A., Schmidt, W. and Turkel, E., "Numerical Solution of the Euler Equations by Finite-Volume Methods Using Runge-Kutta Time-Stepping Schemes," AIAA Paper 81-1259, June 1981.
- 5.2.4 Usab, Jr., W.J. and Murman, E.M., "Embedded Mesh Solutions of the Euler Equations Using a Multi-grid Method," AIAA 83-1946-CP, 6th Computational Fluid Dynamics Conference, Danvers, MA, 13-15 July 1983 <u>https://doi.org/10.2514/6.1983-1946</u>
- 5.2.5 Jameson, A. and Baker, T.J., "Multigrid Solution of the Euler Equations for Aircraft Configurations," AIAA-84-0093, 22nd Aerospace Sciences Meeting, Reno, Nevada, January 1984.
- 5.2.6 Benek, J.A., Buning, P.G., and Steger, J.L., "A 3-D Chimera Grid Embedding Technique," AIAA Paper 85-1523-CP, 7th Computational Physics Conference, Cincinnati, Ohio, 15-17 July 1985.
- 5.2.7 Löhner, R., Morgan, K., Peraire, J., and Zienkiewicz, O.C., "Finite Element Methods for High Speed Flows," AIAA-85-1531-CP, 7th Computational Physics Conference, Cincinnati, Ohio, 15-17 July 1985.
- 5.2.8 Jameson, A., Baker, T.J., and Weatherill, N.P., "Calculation of Inviscid Transonic Flow over a Complete Aircraft," AIAA Paper 86-0103, 24th Aerospace Sciences Meeting, Reno, Nevada, January 6-9, 1986.
- 5.2.9 Mavriplis, D.J., "Accurate multigrid solution of the Euler equations on unstructured and adaptive meshes," NASA CR 181679, June 1988.
- 5.2.10 Raj, P., "A Generalized Wing-Body Euler Code, FLO-57GWB," Lockheed-California Company Report, LR 30490, June 1983.
- 5.2.11 Sikora, J. S., and Miranda, L. R., "Boundary Integral Grid Generation Technique," AIAA Paper 85-4088, 3rd Applied Aerodynamics Conference, Colorado Springs, Colorado, October 14-16, 1985.
- 5.2.12 Singer, S.W., and Mattson, E.A., "Internal and External Flow Simulation Using Multizone Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Method," SAE Paper 901856, October 1990.
- 5.2.13 Raj, P, Olling, C.R., Sikora, J.S., Keen, J.M., Singer, S.W., and Brennan, J.E., "Three-dimensional Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Method (TEAM), Volume I: Computational Method and Verification," AFWAL-TR-87-3074, June 1989 (*supersedes December 1987 release*).



BIBLIOGRAPHY Topic 5.2 (contd.)

- 5.2.14 Raj, P, Olling, C.R., Sikora, J.S., Keen, J.M., Singer, S.W., and Brennan, J.E., "Three-dimensional Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Method (TEAM), Volume II: Grid Generation User's Manual," AFWAL-TR-87-3074, June 1989 (*supersedes December 1987 release*).
- 5.2.15 Raj, P, Olling, C.R., Sikora, J.S., Keen, J.M., Singer, S.W., and Brennan, J.E., "Three-dimensional Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Method (TEAM), Volume III: Flow Analysis User's Manual," AFWAL-TR-87-3074, June 1989 (*supersedes December 1987 release*).
- 5.2.16 Raj, P., "Aerodynamic Analysis Using Euler Equations: Capabilities and Limitations," Chapter 18, Applied Computational Aerodynamics, Progress in Astronautics and Aeronautics, Vol. 125, AIAA, Washington D.C., 1990, Henne, P.A. (Editor).
- 5.2.17 Singer, S.W., and Mattson, E.A., "Internal and External Flow Simulation Using Multizone Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Methods," SAE Paper 901856, Aerospace Technology Conference and Exposition, Long Beach, CA, October 1-4, 1990.
- 5.2.18 Eriksson, L.E., and Rizzi, A., "Computation of Vortex Flows Around Wings Using the Euler Equations," Proceedings of the 4th GAMM Conference on Numerical Methods in Fluid Mechanics, October 1981.
- 5.2.19 Hitzel, S.M. and Schmidt, W., "Slender Wings with Leading Edge Vortex Separation: A Challenge for Panel Methods and Euler Solvers," AIAA Journal of Aircraft, Vol. 21, No. 10, 1984, pp 751-759.
- 5.2.20 Raj, P., and Sikora, J.S., "Free-Vortex Flows: Recent Encounters with an Euler Code," AIAA Paper 84-0135, 22nd Aerospace Sciences Meeting, Reno, NV, January 9-12, 1984.
- 5.2.21 Murman, E.M., and Rizzi, A., "Applications of Euler Equations to Sharp Edge Delta Wings with Leading Edge Vortices," AGARD Symposium on Application of Computational Fluid Dynamics in Aeronautics, Aux-Ed-Provence, France, April 1986.
- 5.2.22 Raj, P., Sikora, J.S. and Keen, J.M., "Free-Vortex Flow Simulation Using a Three-dimensional Euler Aerodynamic Method," ICAS Paper 86-1.5.2, Proceedings of the 15th Congress of the International Council of the Aeronautical Sciences, London, England, U.K., September 7-12, 1986.
- 5.2.23 Raj, P., Keen, J.M., and Singer, S.W., "Applications of an Euler Aerodynamic Method to Free-Vortex Flow Simulation," AIAA paper 88-2517, Proceedings of the 6th Applied Aerodynamics Conference, Williamsburg, VA, June 6-8, 1988. (Also in AIAA Journal of Aircraft, Vol. 27, No. 11, November 1990, pp 941-949).
- 5.2.24 Raj, P., "An Euler Code for Nonlinear Aerodynamic Analysis: Assessment of Capabilities," SAE Transactions, Vol. 97, Section 1: JOURNAL OF AEROSPACE (1988), pp. 1305-1320. (Also SAE Paper 881486, October 1988)
- 5.2.25 Raj, P., "Recent Developments in the Computational Solutions of Euler Equations (Invited)," Third International Congress of Fluid Mechanics, Cairo, Egypt, January 1990.
- 5.2.26 Raj, P., and Singer, S.W., "Computational Aerodynamics in Aircraft Design: Challenges and Opportunities for Euler/Navier-Stokes Methods," SAE Transactions, Vol. 100, Section 1: JOURNAL OF AEROSPACE, Part 2 (1991), pp 2069-2081 (Also iPAC 911990, International Pacific Air & Space Technology Conference, Gifu, Japan, October 7-11, 1991).



BIBLIOGRAPHY Topic 5.2 (contd.)

- 5.2.27 Steinbrenner, J.P., Chawner, J.R., and Fouts, C.L., "A Structured Approach to Interactive Multiple Block Grid Generation," Application of Mesh Generation to Complex 3-D Configurations, AGARD-CP-464, March 1990.
- 5.2.28 Steinbrenner, J.P., Chawner, J.R., and Fouts, C.L., "Multiple Block Grid Generation in the Interactive Environment," AIAA 90-1602, AIAA 21st Fluid Dynamics, Plasma Dynamics and Lasers Conference, Seattle, WA, June 18-20, 1990.
- 5.2.29 Steinbrenner, J.P., Chawner, J.R., and Fouts, C.L., 'The GRIDGEN 3D Multiple Block Grid Generation System," WRDC-TR-90-3022, July 1990.
- 5.2.30 Steinbrenner, J.P., and Anderson, D.A., "Grid Generation Methodology in Applied Aerodynamics," Chapter 4, Applied Computational Aerodynamics, Progress in Astronautics and Aeronautics, Vol. 125, AIAA, Washington D.C., 1990, Henne, P.A. (Editor).
- 5.2.31 Clarke, D.K., Salas, M.D.,, and Hassan, H.A., "Euler Calculations for Multielement Airfoils using Cartesian Grids," AIAA Journal, Vol. 24, No. 3, March 1986, pp. 353-358.
- 5.2.32 Raj, P., and Harris, B., "Using Surface Transpiration with an Euler Method for Cost-effective Aerodynamic Analysis," AIAA 93-3506, Proceedings of the 11th AIAA Applied Aerodynamics Conference, Monterey, CA, August 9-11, 1993.
- 5.2.33 Bangert, L.H., Johnston, C.E., and Schoop, M.J., "CFD Applications in F-22 Design," AIAA Paper 93-3055, July 1993.
- 5.2.34 Goble, B.D, King, S., Terry, J., and Schoop, M.J., "Inlet Hammershock Analysis Using a 3-D Unsteady Euler/Navier-Stokes Code," AIAA 96-2547, 32nd AIAA, ASME, SAE and ASEE, Joint Propulsion Conference and Exhibit, Lake Buena Vista, FL, July 1-3 1996
- 5.2.35 Olling, C.R., and Mani, K.K., "Navier-Stokes and Euler Computations of the Flow Field Around a Complete Aircraft," SAE paper 881488, October 1988.
- 5.2.36 Raj, P., Olling, C.R., and Singer, S.W., "Application of Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Methods to Aircraft Configuration," ICAS Paper 90-6.4.4, Proceedings of the 17th Congress of the International Council of the Aeronautical Sciences, Stockholm, Sweden, September 9-14, 1990.
- 5.2.37 Goble, B.D., Raj, P., and Kinard, T.A., "Three-dimensional Euler/Navier-Stokes Aerodynamic Method (TEAM) Upgrade, Version 713 User's Manual," WL-TR-93-3115, February 1994.
- 5.2.38 Kinard, T.A., and Harris, B.W., "Evaluation of Two Unstructured CFD Methods," AIAA Paper 94-1877, 12th Applied Aerodynamics Conference, Colorado Springs, Colorado, June 20-24, 1994.
- 5.2.39 Kinard, T.A., Finley, D.B., and Karman, Jr., S.L., "Prediction of Compressibility Effects Using Unstructured Euler Analysis on Vortex Dominated Flow Fields," AIAA 96-2499, 14th Applied Aerodynamics Conference, New Orleans, Louisiana, June 17-20, 1996.
- 5.2.40 Raj, P., Kinard, T.A., and Vermeersch, S.A., "Vortical Flow Simulation Using an Unstructured-Grid Euler Method," ICAS 96-1.4.5, Proceedings of the 20th Congress of the International Council of the Aeronautical Sciences, Sorrento, Italy, September 1996.



BIBLIOGRAPHY Topic 5.2 (contd.)

- 5.2.41 Kinard, T.A., Harris, B.W., and Raj, P., "An Assessment of Viscous Effects in Computational Simulation of Benign and Burst Vortex Flows on Generic Fighter Wind-Tunnel Models Using TEAM Code," NASA Contractor Report 4650, March 1995.
- 5.2.42 Kinard, T.A, Harris, B., and Raj, P., "Computational Simulation of Benign and Burst Vortex Flows," AIAA Paper 95-1815, Proceedings of the 13th Applied Aerodynamics Conference, San Diego, CA, June 19-22, 1995.
- 5.2.43 Frink, N.T., Pirzadeh, S., and Parikh, P., "An Unstructured-Grid Software System for Solving Complex Aerodynamic Problems," NASA CP 3291, pp 289-308. (Also NASA Workshop on Surface Modeling, Grid Generation and Related Issues in Computational Fluid Dynamics (CFD) Solutions, NASA-Lewis Research Center, Cleveland, OH, May 9-11, 1995)
- 5.2.44 Frink, N.T., and Pirzadeh, S.Z., "Tetrahedral Finite-Volume Solutions to the Navier-Stokes Equations on Complex Configurations," NASA/TM-1998-208961, December 1998. https://ntrs.nasa.gov/archive/nasa/casi.ntrs.nasa.gov/19990007832.pdf
- 5.2.45 Goble, B.D., and Hooker, J.R., "Validation of an Unstructured Grid Euler/ Navier-Stokes Code on a Full Aircraft with Propellers," AIAA Paper 2001-1003, 39th Aerospace Sciences Meeting, Reno, Nevada, 8-11 January 2001.
- 5.2.46 Hooker, J.R., "Aerodynamic Development of a Refueling Pod for Tanker Aircraft," AIAA Paper 2002-2805, 20th Applied Aerodynamic Conference, St. Louis, Missouri, 24-26 June 2002.